

**Memorandum of**  
**WBCS (Executive) Officers' Association**  
**to 5<sup>th</sup> State Pay Commission.**

**\*\* Appreciation and Appeal of the WBCS (Executive) Officers' Association.**

The Hon'ble Chairman and the five Hon'ble Members of the fifth West Bengal Pay Commission are all eminent personalities in their respective fields and professions. We are happy with the composition of this Commission and look forward to a set of fair, logical and favourable recommendations from this august Body.

We appeal to the Hon'ble Commission to evolve a comprehensive set of principles of pay determination and career-progression before finalizing the revised pay-structure in order to avoid demoralization and de-motivation presently affecting the WBCS (Executive) Officers, especially in relation to the pay and career relativity between them and contemporary IAS Officers.

**1. INTRODUCTION**

**1.1.** The West Bengal Civil Service (Executive) [subsequently mentioned as either "Service" or "our Service"] has its root in the former Bengal Civil Service which was created in the pre-independence era. Naturally, there was a sea-change in the role of this Service after Independence. The concept of community development and welfare

administration, introduced by the Government of India, added a very humble and humane face to this Service which was synonymous with Magistracy during colonial rule. The basic entry grade designation of our Service Officers - Deputy Magistrate & Deputy Collector - created in 1859, will complete its 150 years in 2009. Simply put, this one instance illustrates the efficacy and durability of this Service. The Officers of this Service are spread over the length and breadth of West Bengal, from the Secretariat to the remotest Blocks, constantly shouldering the main burden of administration in the State Government.

- 1.2.** Comparable with only the Indian Administrative Service (IAS) in our State, one can proudly say that ours is a time-tested Service, with a glorious past, and presently dedicated to the development and welfare of the people of West Bengal. If social accountability is regarded as the prime criterion of measuring the necessity and commitment of a constituted Government Service, our Service proves to be matchless in our State. We would request the Hon'ble Chairman and the Hon'ble Members of the Commission to keep this aspect in view while making their recommendations to the Government.
- 1.3.** As the Cadre strength of our Service is a sizeable number of 1767, our Officers man almost all of the important posts in the districts, directly controlling law-and-order administration including the police administration, development administration as well as revenue administration (except the commercial revenue) and disaster management. The Executive Magistracy in the districts, directly connected with maintenance of peace

and harmony in the society at large, is entirely performed by our Officers. The notable posts in the districts are worth mentioning:

- Block Development Officer (BDO) – Cent percent posts are manned by our Officers.
- Sub-Divisional Officer (SDO) – Almost 93% posts are held by our Officers.
- Additional District Magistrate (ADM) – Almost 80% posts are manned by us.
- District Land & Land Reforms Officer (DLLRO) – All posts, except one or two, belong to our Cadre.
- District Magistrate (DM) – 3 posts have been allotted to Officers of this Service.

**1.4.** The Hon'ble Commission will surely appreciate that the above enumeration of posts signifies the level and reach of the administrative influence our Service Officers wield in the districts. As such, indirectly our Service plays a significant role in the mopping up of commercial revenue in the districts, too.

**1.5.** In Kolkata, our role in the administrative hierarchy is limited to the Secretariat, some important Directorates, management of Government Undertakings and Hospitals, Pay & Accounts Office, and Personal Secretariat of the Hon'ble Ministers. Posts in the Secretariat are worth mentioning because it is the power and nerve-centre of essential departmental governance:

- Special Secretary – 13 posts belong to our Cadre.
- Joint Secretary – 137 posts are manned by our Officers.
- Deputy Secretary – Number of posts has become non-specific because of up-gradation of posts, without corresponding creation of posts in the lower rung, and the bestowal of the rank of OSD & Ex-Officio Deputy Secretary to all Service-Officers in Scale no.18 after their service in the Cadre for 20 years.

Thus in the Secretariat of the State we hold key posts which regulate the entire management of the system of implementation of the policy decisions of the State Government.

**1.6.** Some other important posts in Kolkata deserve mention. The posts are:

- Secretary, Public Service Commission.
- Chief Executive Officer, Indian Statistical Institute (Govt. of India deputation).
- Director, Asiatic Society (Govt. of India deputation).

**1.7.** The nature of the duties and responsibilities which our Service Officers are entrusted to take up, varies widely. Whether in the districts or in the Directorates and the Secretariat, virtually no Government Department functions without the active and beneficial association of our Service Officers. Especially in the districts, our Officers have to work round the clock, and often they do

not get the scope of enjoying even the routine weekend holidays.

**1.8.** A brief pen picture of some of the important posts in the district is furnished below:

- The post of the BDO, by itself, amply demonstrates the wide-ranging versatility of our Officers in handling of various types of work simultaneously. The State Government has recognized the importance of the coordinating role played by the BDO at the Block and Panchayat Samity level, by issuing an Order but a lot of codification is further required for effective implementation of the Order. We are enclosing a separate write-up on what can be done for making the BDO deliver more in his coordinating capacity (***Please see Annexure***).
- At the sub-divisional and district levels the Deputy Magistrate and the Deputy Collectors act as the extension of the SDO and the District Magistrate in their various capacities both as Executive Magistrate as well as Collector.
- There are so many Departmental special posts held by our Officers in the districts that some at least deserve special mention in the following paragraphs:
  1. The **Additional Executive Officers** and the **Secretaries of the Zilla Parishads** handle the basic administration of the Zilla Parishads.
  2. The **District Panchayat and Rural Development Officer**, accountable to the Panchayat & Rural

Development Department, is a key functionary of the district, as can be easily understood from the designation itself.

3. The **District Planning Officer** is placed similarly under the Development & Planning Department.
4. The posts of the **District Municipal Development Officer**, created very recently, are being filled up by our Officers. The Department of Municipal Affairs created these posts for more effective administration of the Municipalities of the State. This demonstrates, in a small way, the Government's trust in our Service.
5. The **Project Officer-cum-District Welfare Officer** under the Backward Classes Welfare Department is the most important Officer posted in the districts for the supervision and implementation of welfare schemes meant for the backward classes.
6. The **Project Director** of the District Rural Development Cell of the Zilla Parishads leads a separate team of Officers under the overall supervision of the Panchayat & Rural Development Department, for implementation of rural development schemes through the Panchayati Raj Institutions at the lower tiers, namely Panchayat Samity and Gram Panchayat.
7. **Officer in-Charge of the National Rural Employment Guarantee Programme**, the most prestigious development programme of the Government of India, has been exclusively entrusted

to monitor effective implementation of the programme at the grassroot level.

- 1.9.1.** The effectiveness of our Service Officers in diverse fields of work has created a situation where every Department wants WBCS (Exe.) Officers for new and challenging assignments. It is reported that, because of this demand, the Cadre Review Committee has recommended an increase of about 200 posts in our Cadre in various Government Departments. Recently, the newly created posts of the **District Minority Development Officer** and the **District Self-Help Group & Self-Employment Officer** are being allotted to our Officers.
- 1.9.2.** On a cursory enquiry one can see that at the highest tier of the Government the recent trend of work has become Officer- oriented. As a result, the post of Joint Secretary has become the focal point of activity in the Secretariat where a substantial number of such pivotal posts are manned by our Service Officers. At the senior most level, 13 posts of Special Secretary are held by our Officers.
- 1.10.1.** Over the last ten years our Service has emerged as the substitute of the IAS. In the districts IAS Officers used to hold all the posts of DM, a major portion of ADM and SDO posts, ten years ago. Now we are holding almost all the posts of SDO, ADM and 3 posts of DM. At the levels of Joint Secretary and Special Secretary also we are functioning as a substitute of IAS Officers. The Hon'ble Members of the Commission will surely appreciate that the special position our Service occupies in the administrative hierarchy of the State Government naturally demands a comparative edge in the pay

structure at all levels in relation to the other State Government Services. This will attract candidates of best merit to join the Service, besides ensuring an incentive for the Officers now toiling tirelessly with a comparatively larger burden on their shoulders.

**1.10.2.** Here we quote two observations from the ***Report of the Administrative Reforms Committee of the State Government*** (popularly known as "The Ashok Mitra Committee"), published in ***April 1983***:

**(1)** " We shall also urge that the services of matured and experienced officers belonging to the State Civil Services should be put to greater use for providing leadership in the district administration." (Para 9.11. Page 13)

**(2)** " The Committee is further of the view that the number of posts reserved for the All-India Service cadres should be reviewed from time to time with a view to creating greater opportunities for able and efficient State Service Officers." (Para 13.10. Page 20)

**1.11.1.** Prior to April 1981, this Service was allowed an edge over the Allied Services of the State Government. We would appeal to the Hon'ble Commission to appreciate that, like IAS Officers, our Services Officers constitute a general management cadre with maximum horizontal mobility, and are entrusted to play coordinating roles in diverse situations at various levels in different Departments. A fundamental principle of a well-managed organization demands that an Officer entrusted with the job of inter-departmental coordination should have a higher edge in



pay compared to those Officers whose activities are coordinated. Compared with Allied and other services, treated as our equals, the sheer magnitude of managerial responsibility shouldered by our Service Officers makes this Service ***the first among equals.***

**1.11.2.** At this point we would quote from the Report of the last State Pay Commission the following two excerpts:

**(1)** "... in the matter of pay scales, this service had been enjoying an edge over other State Services up to 1981."  
(Page 130)

**(2)** " Having regard to the important role this service has all along been called upon to play in the general administration and outside of it, namely Panchayat and rural development administration, in the State Undertakings, Statutory Bodies, etc. we recommend increasing the posts in scale no. 19 for this service...".  
(Page 131)

We would, therefore, appeal to the Hon'ble Commission to restore the higher edge in the pay structure in our favour.

## **2. Present Pay Structure**

**2.1.** The following chart illustrates the Pay Scales our Service Officers enjoy in their Service tenure:

<b>Scales</b>	<b>Tenure</b>	<b>Rank</b>	<b>Number of Officers (As in October 2008)</b>
No. 16	Upto 8 years	Entry Grade	608
No. 17	From 9 <sup>th</sup> year to 16 years	Assistant Secretary Rank (On completion of 10 years)	424
No. 18	From 16 <sup>th</sup> year to 27/28 years	Deputy Secretary Rank (On completion of 20 years)	336
No. 19	After 27/28 years according to available vacancy	Joint Secretary	137
No. 21	After 31 years according to available vacancy	Special Secretary	13
Existing total-			<b>1518</b>

**2.2.** As we have noted in Para **1.11.** our Officers do not enjoy any higher pay benefit in the entry grade of Scale No. 16, except the Special Pay very recently introduced only for the post of BDO. This is the toughest phase for a new entrant to the Service. While a direct recruit has to slog for an average of six years in two Blocks as BDO, after a probation period of two years, a Promotee Officer goes straight to work as a BDO after an induction level training (introduced a year back). The tenure of Block posting for the Promotee Officers depends on their age of induction into the Service.

**2.3.** Here, we must point it out to the Hon'ble Chairman & Members of the Commission that while the job hazards and lack of pay-edge in the Service prompt talented fresh aspirants to opt for other Allied Services instead of WBCS (Exe.), the lack of significant financial benefits, coupled with the spectre of occupational perils, discourages a good number of the Feeder Service Officers (especially Officers belonging to the Land & Land Reforms Department) from opting for promotion to our Service. Besides, there is no career advancement at this level except the scale promotion to Scale No.17 by virtue of the Modified Career Advancement Scheme (MCAS) which is available to all State Government employees including the Group D staff.

**2.4.** If we compare scale promotion prospects available to the WBCS (Judicial) and IAS Officers at the basic grade, the relative deficiency of our service prospects looks glaringly disadvantageous. While the Judges get the next higher scale after serving for only 5 years the IAS Officers get the same after 4 years. The Hon'ble Members can here feel the necessity of a scale promotion for our Service Officers after 5 years when one Officer completes his/ her first three years in a Block as BDO and is ready to handle the responsibility of a more critical Block elsewhere, as a senior BDO.

**2.5.** The Service Officers placed in Scale No. 17 are variously posted in the districts as Deputy Magistrate & Deputy Collector, specially posted Departmental Officers, SDO or equivalent, and in some cases, as Private Secretary to Ministers. After a tenure of 10 years in the Service an Officer enjoys the rank of Assistant Secretary, but this rank becomes meaningless as almost no such post is

available to us in the Secretariat. Besides, an Officer of the West Bengal Secretariat Service, gradually promoted from the Clerical Cadre, enjoys the status of Deputy Secretary in the same scale.

- 2.6.** In contrast, our Officers again have to wait for MCAS benefits after a tenure of 16 years, and then have to wait for another 4 years in Scale no. 18 (i.e. after a service tenure of 20 years) to get the rank of a Deputy Secretary. This is one of the points where the pre-eminence of our Service gets grossly undermined, despite earning such platitudes as the **'Premier Service'** of our State (As observed in the Draft Report of the present Administrative Reforms Committee which incidentally also notes that our Service is **"severely suffering from lack of career mobility"**).
- 2.7.** In this phase of Service assumption of higher responsibility should automatically ensure a higher Pay Scale. The Service Officers move from Deputy Magistrate & Deputy Collector posts to special Departmental posts after an average tenure of 12 years, before becoming SDO shortly thereafter. In comparison, WBCS (Judicial) Officers get the next higher scale after 10 years whereas IAS Officers get it after 9 years of service.
- 2.8.1.** Officers of the Service enjoying Scale No. 18 hold most vital posts of the Government (before becoming Joint Secretaries), namely, ADM, OSD & Ex-Officio Deputy Secretary, Deputy Secretary, Private Secretary to Ministers and Private Secretary to Chief Minister etc.. Ironically, it is in this phase that our career mobility gets even more severely restricted. At present, our Service

Officers placed in this scale (No. 18) have to wait for an average of 12 years before getting promotion to Scale no.19 as Joint Secretary. It means a service-tenure of 28 years. Hon'ble Chairman and Members of the Commission can appreciate our view that this career lag robs the sheen of our Service to a great extent. A contemporary IAS Officer gets this scale after a service-tenure of 13 years while a WBCS (Judicial) Officer gets the same after an average service-tenure of 13-15 years.

**2.8.2.** When one of our Officers serving the Government at this level compares his relative career prospects with that of his contemporaries mentioned above, it has a profound demoralizing effect on his mindset because of the acute stagnation affecting his career progression at the stage. This de-motivates him not only while carrying on with his official duty in his present capacity, but also at the subsequent stages of his career. One can only say with some amount of regret that the Government can hardly expect dynamic service from this group of disillusioned Officers in spite of their unquestionable commitment to Government work.

**2.9.1.** We would also like the Hon'ble Commission to note that, in contrast to the Officers of the West Bengal Secretariat Service, neither the promotee Officers nor the special recruits of our Service are getting a chance to advance to the rank of Joint Secretary, because of the bottleneck in the movement from Scale no.18 to Scale no.19. Those who have relatively shorter lengths of service are retiring in the Scale no.17 itself. The rest of such Officers are all retiring in Scale no. 18. When these Officers start their career in the Feeder posts they get the Scale no. 12/14 whereas the

Officers of the West Bengal Secretariat Service start their career in the clerical cadre in Scale no. 8/9. Thus we can see how an Officer starts his career above the clerical cadre but ends his career at a significantly lower level. This has an adverse effect on the above group of Officers after they enter this Service. This is not only an anomalous situation but also an injustice. We would appeal to the Hon'ble Commission to rectify this position.

**2.9.2.** Here we would request the Hon'ble Chairman and Members of the Commission to note the following observation of the ***Report of the Administrative Reforms Committee of the State Government*** (popularly known as "The Ashok Mitra Committee"), published in ***April 1983***:

**(1)** "We may mention in passing that the morale of State administration, both at the headquarters, and in the districts, is likely to improve significantly provided, *in matters of promotion and advancement of career, some consideration is given to the case of officers who were promoted to the State Civil Service and have put in a relatively long service in Government.*" (Para 9.12. Page no.13 – ***italics ours***)

**2.10.** In addition to the problems affecting our career advancement mentioned so far, we would like to point it out to the Hon'ble Chairman and Members of the Commission that a general problem of scale overlapping at all levels of the above career advancements yields only marginal financial benefits for the Officers when they get the higher scales. This is a major shortcoming of the existing scheme of career advancement that has to be set

right by the Hon'ble Commission through its recommendations.

- 2.11.1.** Apart from all the above points of consideration, we would request the Hon'ble Commission to note our following submissions regarding the relatively better career mobility available to some of the other State Services. This is most unfortunate.
  
- 2.11.2.** In 1983 Finance Department issued Memo No. 12560-F dated 12-10-1983 which clearly mentions that the Government policy is to allow the first movement to the higher scale to an employee after a minimum service span of 6 years and the second movement to the next higher scale after a minimum service span of 13 years.
  
- 2.11.3.** However, this 1983 circular was quashed by the Calcutta High Court in C.O. No. 590(W) of 1988. As a consequence, according to the 1981 promotion policy, there was no minimum service period prescribed for moving up to the next two higher pay scales. Newly constituted services like the West Bengal Food & Supplies Service, the West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service derived maximum benefit because of this judgment. There are many instances where Officers of the West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service moved on to the second higher scale within two years of entry to the service. Thus Officers of West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service Officers of 1980s enjoy higher basic pay than contemporary Officers of our Service. To cite an example, as on 1 August 2008, an Officer of the 1980 Batch of the West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service drew a Basic Pay of Rs.

16500/= whereas an Officer of the 1980 Batch of WBCS (Executive) drew a Basic Pay of Rs. 15750/=.

**2.11.4.** For the West Bengal General Service, the West Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) and the West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service, distribution of posts has been made in the ratio of 6: 3: 1. Whenever there is any increase in the cadre strength the posts are being continuously distributed in that ratio of 6: 3: 1. In case of the West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service the cadre strength increased due to merger of their Junior Service with them. Now the cadre strength is more than 1000. As a consequence more and more Officers of this Service get the benefit of moving on to the next scale as per 1981 policy. This feature is totally absent in our Service. Our cadre strength has remained constant at 1767 and no Officer of this Service has got the next scales even in the minimum period of 6 years or 13 years as originally contemplated by the Government. In fact, our Officers got scale change only after 10 years of Service in term of the Career Advancement Scheme, 1990.

**2.12.1.** Special Secretary Posts are the highest responsibility our Officers are given in the Secretariat. At present 13 posts in Scale no. 21 are allotted for us. The last State Pay Commission felt the inadequacy of promotional avenues available to these senior most Service Officers and recommended allotment of at least 8 posts of Special Secretary. Afterwards, the State Government felt it essential to increase the number to 13.

**2.12.2.** Unfortunately, the average service length of our Officers, who do not get promotion to the IAS (financially very



lucrative at present) because of the age-factor, is not more than 32 years. This group of Officers is getting this highest post well after 30 years of service. As a result, they are able to serve in this post on an average tenure of one year (actually six months to one-and-half year). Consequently, on the one hand, the Government is not able to utilize fully their service experience at this stage; and on the other, this touch-and-go phenomenon has been undermining the importance of these senior most posts. On both counts the situation is not desirable. This also makes the exit level (the point of superannuation) of the Service somewhat unappealing. New aspirants to the Service often try to gauge the importance of the Service by assessing the level of pre-eminence both at the entry and the exit levels. We have illustrated how this edge has been blunted. In subsequent paragraphs we shall suggest suitable measures to arrest this trend.

### **3. Proposed Pay Structure**

**3.1.1.** We feel the concept of Pay Band and Grade Pay introduced by the Government of India, following the recommendation of the Sixth Central Pay Commission (CPC), is a most original and excellent idea. We have studied the concept extensively. We feel it is most logical and scientific. It is primarily aimed at the welfare of the employees, and according to our perception, it is a scheme which a good employer should adopt. In addition, we would like to demand that the new pay structure should come into force from 1<sup>st</sup> January, 2006 for all State Government employees.

**3.1.2.** Accordingly, we propose that the entire restructure of Pay Scales through Pay Band and Grade Pay; annual increment at a uniform rate of 3% of Pay; and the mode of fixation of Pay in the new Pay Bands, as adopted by the Government of India, should be followed at all levels. The

only departure we propose is that the month of increment may not be made the same for all employees. This recommendation of the CPC does not appear to be conducive to us. We do not find any reason behind such a step; it neither benefits the employees as a whole, nor is it advantageous for the Government.

### **3.2. Fixation in, and Movement to, Higher Pay Scales**

- 3.2.1.** We have already shown in paragraphs no. **2.3** and **2.4** how the Service has become unattractive, especially at the entry point.
- 3.2.2.** Considering this aspect as well as the edge in Pay we are proposing, we propose allotment of Pay Band 3, with Grade Pay of Rs. 5400/-, corresponding to the existing Scale no.16, for entry grade Officers, with a provision of 2 additional increments at the starting point. This marginal edge over other State Services will be in tune with the edge in Pay given to IAS Officers by the Government of India, and this will make the Service attractive to fresh blood as well as to the Promotee Officers. Besides, this edge in Pay will have an additional cushioning effect on the hazards faced by the BDOs (who are placed in the entry grade).
- 3.2.3.** Movement (First scale promotion) to the next higher grade from the entry grade (i.e. from existing Scale no.16 to Scale no.17) occurs at present after 8 years. While the policy of the State Government provided an eligibility-span of 6 years in this respect, WBCS (Judicial) Officers move to the corresponding higher scale in 5 years and the IAS Officers in 4 years. Considering all these, as well as our reasoning at Paragraphs **2.2** to **2.4**, we propose that the movement to the higher grade in Pay Band 3 (with a grade Pay of Rs.

6600/-) should be made automatic for confirmed Officers of the Service after 2 years of Probation and 3 years as BDO in the first Block-posting, taken together, that is **after 5 years of service**.

- 3.2.4.** We propose allotment of Pay Band 3, with grade Pay of Rs. 6600/-, for Officers presently enjoying Scale no.17. At this stage, too, we are proposing a provision of 2 additional increments at the starting point, in line with the edge allowed to the IAS Officers, and the edge we would like to have in our favour.
- 3.2.5.** From this stage we propose automatic movement to the higher grade (2<sup>nd</sup> scale promotion) in Pay Band 3 (with a grade Pay of Rs. 7600/-) after a total service of 12 years. While the Government Policy provided an eligibility of 13 years for this movement, the WBCS (Judicial) Officers get it after 10 years and the IAS Officers after 9 years. Our proposal also takes into account that after 12 years our Officers are poised to get functionally very important postings as SDO or its equivalent.
- 3.2.6.** For Officers presently placed in Scale no.18 we propose allotment of Pay Band 3 with a grade Pay of Rs. 7600/- with 2 additional increments at the starting point. This is the last point where we are proposing the introduction of the additional increments in line with our argument for establishment of a symbolic edge over other State Services.
- 3.2.7.** We have shown in Paragraphs **2.8.1 and 2.8.2** how our direct recruit Officers are presently stagnating at this level and, in Paragraph **2.9**, how all the Promotee Officers are retiring at this stage or earlier, without getting elevation to the post of Joint Secretary. However, as we are not proposing automatic movement to the level of Joint Secretary because of various

constraints, including the concept of number of posts earmarked by the Government from this level upwards, we would like to present before the Hon'ble Commission a package of composite proposals for better movement to the higher pay-scales (starting with the elevation to Scale No. 19) for consideration and recommendation. **But before that we propose allotment of Pay Band 4, with Grade Pay of Rs. 8700/-, for Joint Secretaries presently enjoying Scale No.19.**

**3.2.8(A).** The pool of Officers in Scale No.-19 (137 in number) hold the most important and pivotal posts in the Secretariat and Directorate, apart from the 3 posts of District Magistrate. Moreover, Officers of the Service, who come under the zone of consideration for promotion to the IAS, generally belong to this group. However, this promotion to the IAS reveals the extent of pay-discrimination that our Service Officers have been subjected to. An Officer of our Service who gets promoted to the IAS enjoys a pay packet **higher by Rs. 12000/- (before the introduction of the new pay structure of the 6th CPC)** than his/her batch-mate in the Service who could not get the promotion despite holding same seniority and identical job responsibility. At the same time, it is to be noted that getting promotion to the IAS does not necessarily depend on performance and merit position of an Officer. ***The important determinant in this regard is the age of an Officer, because the upper age-limit for promotion to the IAS is 54 years.***

**3.2.8(B).** The above-noted huge gap in salary (and the corresponding embarrassing difference in Retirement benefits), apart from different other benefits or allowances like LTC, medical facilities etc. has had an enormously demoralizing effect on the entire Cadre of

our Service in general, and this group of Officers in Scale No.-19 in particular. This demoralization in Scale No.-19 and the stagnation in Scale No.-18 have initiated a very significant phenomenon which was never experienced previously : Officers are frequently opting for Government of India deputation posts, and in some instances, are even inclined to quit their jobs to join Private Corporate Bodies offering lucrative salary and perquisites.

**3.2.8(C).** At this juncture, we request the Hon'ble Members of the Commission to consider this issue with all the gravity it demands, while formulating its recommendations to the Government.

**3.2.9(A).** For Officers presently posted as Special Secretary enjoying Scale No. 21 we propose allotment of Pay Band- 4 with Grade Pay of Rs. 10000/-.

**3.2.9(B).** As we have pointed out in the Para no. **2.8.1** the average tenure of an Officer of the Service comes to 27-28 years before he gets the post of Joint Secretary in Scale No. – 19. Thus the average stay of an Officer in this scale is between 3 and 4 years. Those who are lucky to have greater lengths of service can move to the next pay scale available to us, i.e. Scale No.-21. But stay in this scale is generally less than 2 years as we have shown in Para no. **2.12.2. *This short stay as Special Secretary, coupled with the indifference of the Government in better utilization of the services of this very senior group of Officers, has made such scale movement a routine affair.*** Besides, this phenomenon makes this change rather insignificant in the Departments where such Officers are placed. We have proposed better management of the cadre at this level in the following paragraphs.

**3.3. The Package of Proposed Vertical Movement to Scale No. 19 and Upwards:**

**3.3.1.** We have explained in detail in the foregoing paragraphs the present position of vertical movement of Officers of the Service in the Pay Scales (from Scale No. 16 to Scale No. 21). In order to remove the bottleneck in movement from the Joint Secretary level upwards we propose the following three measures:

- (1) Marginally increasing Joint Secretary posts in Scale No.- 19 to 150 in number (from existing 137 posts).
- (2) Opening of existing Pay Scale No. 20, hitherto not given to us, for Joint Secretaries serving more than one year in Scale No. 19, and allotting 60 posts (40% of 150 posts in Scale No. 19) in that level, designated as Senior Joint Secretary. Corresponding allotment of Pay Band-4 with Grade Pay of Rs. 8,900/- is proposed for Officers of this level while re-structuring the pay scale. Benefit in financial terms will be very marginal at this stage. But opening of the Pay Scale is crucial not only for our better movement to the level of the Special Secretary but also for easing the stagnation below the level of Joint Secretary.
- (3A) Increasing Special Secretary posts to 35 in number (from existing 13 posts). We propose earmarking of these posts in 35 important Departments in such a manner that these Special Secretaries can streamline the Secretarial supervision over the Joint Secretaries working in the Departments. In this way these Officers will be able to play a significant role

in their Departments under the Principal Secretary heading the Departments. If the Hon'ble Commission agrees in this respect we can sit with the Government to identify the Departments where we want these Special Secretary posts to be earmarked.

(3)B At this stage, however, we would like to place before the Hon'ble Members of the Commission a special demand for recommendation to the Government: giving charge of one or two Departments as Secretary to one or two Officers from among the above group of 35 Officers. We are observing that the dearth of direct recruit IAS Officers at the Secretarial level is creating a situation in which one Principal Secretary of a Department is being burdened with the additional charge of another Department. Besides, it has to be kept in mind that our senior most Officers have been manning the posts of Special Secretary over the last 10 years and are ready to hold independent charge as Secretary. Moreover, the Hon'ble Members of the Commission can appreciate that at this level our Officers should get an opportunity to utilize their wide and varied experience in the Service by holding independent charge of a Department.

**3.3.2.** What we plan to achieve through this proposed package:

- (A) Allowing Officers retiring in Scale No. 19 one more opportunity of upward movement in their service career.
- (B) Making a provision of corresponding vertical movement from Scale No. -18 to Scale No. 19 within 21- 22 years of service. This will also allow some

Promotee Officers, with a relatively longer tenure in the Service, to work and retire as Joint Secretaries.

(C) Allowing 2% of our Officers, according to the total cadre-strength of 1767, to become Special Secretaries and serve the Government with appropriate dignity before their superannuation.

(D) Making a provision for one or two of our Officers to function as Secretary of one or two Departments.

**3.3.3.** For the benefit of the Hon'ble Chairman and Members of the Commission we are enclosing in tabular form our proposal on pay structure and upward movement in the following page.

**TABLE FOLLOWS IN PAGE NO. 24**

INSERT TABLE OF PROPOSED SCALES AND VERTICAL MOVEMENTS



#### 4. ALLOWANCES

##### 4.1. House Rent Allowance (HRA)

4.1.1. At present HRA is given @15% of Basic Pay per month for the entire group of Officers and Staff employed by the State Government. There is an upper ceiling of Rs. 2000/-. This arbitrary imposition of the upper ceiling has effectively brought down the actual HRA to a lesser scale for all Officers in general, and Senior Officers in particular. This low rate of HRA, coupled with the meagre upper ceiling, compare most disfavouredly with the 30% HRA allowed in Metropolitan Cities by the Government of India (GOI), without any upper ceiling. This is an indication of the State Government's attitude : depriving the Officers only. Moreover, the logic behind the amount of HRA being given by the GOI is the high costs of house rent and of maintenance (for house owners).

4.1.2. We would, therefore, request the Hon'ble Members of the Commission to recommend HRA for our Officers at the following rates, ***without any upper ceiling:***

Sl No.	Area	Proposed HRA
01	Kolkata and its Urban Agglomeration Areas & New Delhi.	30% of Basic Pay
02	Three Hill Sub-Divisions under Darjeeling district	30% of Basic Pay
03	Other areas in the State	20% of Basic Pay

**4.1.3.** We would request the Hon'ble Members of the Commission to remove another punishing restriction on couples, or one of the spouses, working under the State Government. The existing upper ceiling of Rs. 2000/- is applicable on the HRA admissible to both of them taken together, while the GOI allows unlimited HRA individually to both the spouses working under it. The Hon'ble Commission should recommend GOI norms in this respect.

**4.2. Dearness Allowance (DA)**

At present State Government employees are not getting DA at par with the employees of the GOI in spite of the declared policy of the State Government that such allowance will be at par with that given by the GOI. We propose grant of DA for the state officials at the same rate and with effect from the same date as and when granted by the GOI for their officials.

**4.3. Group Insurance**

We propose that the scheme of Group Insurance should be revised in line with the revision made by the GOI for its Officers in the following uniform manner:

<b>Sum Insured: Rs. 7.2 lakhs.</b>	<b>Monthly premium: Rs. 720</b>
------------------------------------	---------------------------------

**4.4. Children Education Allowance and Reimbursement of Tuition Fee:**

We propose reimbursement of Tuition Fee upto two children and the annual ceiling fixed at Rs. 12000/- per child. Hostel subsidy may be reimbursed upto Rs.3000/-

per month per child and the above limit may be automatically raised by 25% every time the DA on the revised pay structure goes up by 50%, on the pattern admissible to the Officers of the GOI. *[As per implementation of the GOI No. 12011/03/2008-Estt (Allowance) dated 2 September, 2008 of Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievance and Pensions, GOI].*

#### **4.5. Leave Travel Concession (LTC):**

We hope that the Hon'ble Members of the Commission would put an end to the long standing deprivation of our Officers in respect of the existing pattern of LTC. It is not only discriminatory but also derogatory. We propose that Officers may be allowed to travel along with their families to any place in India once in a block of 4 years. We also propose that the Officer may be allowed leave encashment to the extent of 10 days in line with the scheme of LTC for GOI Officers, over and above the leave encashment admissible to the extent of 300 days (maximum) at the time of superannuation.

#### **4.6. Transfer Grant:**

We propose transfer grant of one month's pay in all cases of transfer where a change of station, along with a change of residence, is involved. We also demand transfer grant equal to a month's pay last drawn in case of those employees who, after retirement, settle down at places other than the last station of their duty located at a distance of more than 20 kilometres. In the case of Officers who settle after retirement at the last station of duty itself, one-third of the composite transfer grant may

be allowed, provided a change of residence is involved. [As per implementation of the GOI Order No. 19030/3/2008-E.IV dated 23 September 2008, of the Finance Department of the GOI].

#### **4.7 Traveling Allowance and Daily Allowance (TA & DA) :**

We propose that the existing system of TA & DA should be continued, with proportionate increase in the rates after the revised pay structure becomes effective.

#### **4.8 Hill Allowance and Winter Allowance :**

We propose continuation of the above allowances at the existing rates, with quantum increase commensurate with increase in pay after pay revision.

#### **4.9 Deputation Allowance :**

At present the concept of deputation allowance is non-functional for our Officers. We propose that the Hon'ble Members of the Commission may recommend to the Government a specific guideline in this regard.

### **5. RETIREMENT BENEFITS**

#### **5.1. Gratuity:**

It is quite incomprehensible why our Service Officers should be subjected to arbitrary discrimination in respect of death-cum-retirement gratuity vis-à-vis GOI Officers. The upper limit of gratuity for State Government Officers has been fixed at Rs. 2.5 lakhs. This again hurts the Officers in particular. We propose that this anti-Officer

bias should not be allowed any more by the Hon'ble Members of the Commission. We would urge them to recommend raising of the upper ceiling to Rs. 10 lakhs, in line with the gratuity allowed by the GOI to their Officers.

**5.2.1. Pension:**

We propose that the concept of full pension with 33 years of qualifying service should be dispensed with. Once an Officer has rendered the minimum qualifying service of 20 years, pension should be paid @ 50% of emoluments last drawn. We agree with the observation of the 6<sup>th</sup> CPC while recommending full pension after 20 years of qualifying service.

**5.2.2. Family Pension:**

We propose that the GOI norms should be followed in this regard.

**5.2.3. Quantum of Pension:**

We propose that the quantum of pension/ family pension should be increased as implemented by the GOI [*Para 5.7 & 8.3. of Order no. 38/37/08 P&PW(A) dated 2 September, 2008, of Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievance and Pensions, GOI*].

**5.2.4. Commutation of Pension:**

We propose that an Officer should be allowed to commute up to 40% of his /her admissible pension.

**5.2.5. Leave Encashment :**

Present arrangement of leave encashment at the time of superannuation should be continued.

Hon'ble Members of the Commission may, however, consider increasing the limit of maximum leave encashable.

**6. Additional Ex-gratia Lump sum Compensation in case of Death While Performing Duty :**

We propose that the amount of ex-gratia lump sum compensation should be revised as shown in the table below:

1.	Death occurring because of accidents in course of performance of duty	Rs. 10 lakhs
2.	Death occurring in course of performance of duty attributable to acts of violence by terrorists, anti-social elements etc.	Rs. 15 lakhs
3.	Death occurring while on duty on account of natural disasters/ election related violence/ extreme weather condition.	Rs. 15 lakhs

**7. Source of Financing the increased Pay Bill.**

**7.1.** In this regard we would like to draw the attention of the Hon'ble Members of the Commission to the observation of the 6th CPC in its report which states that "It is observed that most of the states would be in a position to meet the additional expenditure" (para 1.3.32). The 6th CPC also states that " Out of the States expected to follow the Sixth Central Pay Commission's recommendations, only Goa and Tamil Nadu are estimated to be in a marginally revenue deficit situation in 2007 -08, as per the RBI report" (para 1.3.31). Naturally, we can expect the State Government to be in a relatively comfortable situation in this regard.

**7.2.** We hope the Hon'ble Members of the Commission will agree that there is enough scope to increase income from

various State revenues by plugging the loopholes in the system of revenue collection and toning up the revenue earning departments. In this connection we would like to present before the Hon'ble Members of the Commission an extract from the report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year 2006-07 in respect of our State :

"Test check of the records relating to receipts from various Departments conducted during the year 2006-07, revealed non/short realisation, short assessment etc. of revenue amounting to **Rs. 3,103.67 crore in 777 cases** as mentioned below :

<b>Sl No</b>	<b>Category of Tax/Non-tax</b>	<b>No of Cases</b>	<b>Amount (Rs in Crore)</b>
1	Sales Tax	246	28.91
2	Land Revenue	86	968.05
3	State Excise	144	92.73
4	Motor Vehicles Tax	61	134.01
5	Amusement Tax	12	10.32
6	Stamp Duty & Registration Fees	33	3.52
7	Profession Tax	54	1.64
8	Electricity Duty	20	57.58
9	Mines & Minerals	57	85.76
10	Non-tax Receipts		
i)	Interest Receipts	12	1695.39
ii)	Forest receipts	26	2.6
iii)	Police receipts	8	16.7
iv)	Receipts from Irrigation & Waterways	18	6.46
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>777</b>	<b>3103.67</b>

## **SYNOPSIS OF THE MEMORANDUM**

A. The main thrust of our submission before the Commission is two-fold :

1. To establish a meaningful edge in pay and promotional avenues for our Service Officers, in line with the significant role our Service plays in the State Government's administrative hierarchy. At present our career prospects are lagging far behind those of the IAS, the WBCS (Judicial) and even behind those available to the West Bengal Secretariat Service and the West Bengal Audit & Accounts Service.
2. To show how our Service has come to function as the substitute of the IAS as the supreme managerial cadre in the State Government and urge the Hon'ble Commission to formulate its recommendations in our favour accordingly.

### **B. Our Demands for In-Service Officers**

1. Date of effect of the new pay structure : 1<sup>st</sup> January, 2006.
2. Introduction of GOI's Pay Band-3, with Grade Pay of Rs. 5400/- for the Grade No. 1 (Entry grade), corresponding to the existing Scale No.16, plus 2 additional increments at the initial stage.
3. Introduction of GOI's Pay Band-3, with Grade Pay of Rs. 6600/- for the Grade No. 2 corresponding to the existing Scale No.17, plus 2 additional increments at the initial stage.



4. Introduction of GOI's Pay Band-3, with Grade Pay of Rs. 7600/- for the Grade No. 3 corresponding to the existing Scale No.18, plus 2 additional increments at the initial stage.
5. Introduction of GOI's Pay Band-4, with Grade Pay of Rs. 8700/- for the Grade No. 4 corresponding to the existing Scale No.19, with 150 posts of Joint Secretary earmarked for our Service.
6. Opening of a new Grade No. 5 in Pay Band-4 with Grade Pay of Rs. 8900/-, corresponding to the existing Scale No. 20 (hitherto not given to our Service) for 60 posts of Senior Joint Secretaries (new scheme).
7. Introduction of GOI's Pay Band-4, with Grade Pay of Rs. 10000/- for the Grade No. 6, corresponding to the existing Scale No.21, with 35 posts of Special Secretary earmarked for our Service in 35 prominent Departments.
8. Giving charge of one/two Departments as Secretary to our Officers.
9. Annual increment at the uniform rate of 3% of Pay at all levels. However, no fixing of one particular month for such increments for all Officers.
10. We propose pay fixation to be similar to that of the GOI's scheme, and as per the Table of the Union Ministry of Finance. *[GOI F No. 1/1/2008-IC dated 30 August 2008 of the Union Ministry of Finance]*. It is logical to maintain the difference between the junior and senior Officers. In case of fixation following the recommendations of the earlier Pay Commissions (both CPC and SPC) such difference

was wiped out over a good number of batches of Officers, causing widespread grievance among the senior Officers.

11. Automatic vertical mobility from Grade No. 1 (Entry Grade) to Grade No. 2 after 5 years of service.
12. Automatic vertical mobility from Grade No. 2 to Grade No. 3 after 12 years of service.
13. Vertical movement from Grade No. 3 to Grade No. 6 as per available vacancy, but only according to our composite proposal of 150 posts in the Joint Secretary level, 60 posts in the Senior Joint Secretary level, and 35 posts in the Special Secretary level.
14. Formulating Commission's recommendations in such a manner that the huge gap, in the salary of our Service Officers compared with that of the contemporary Officers promoted to the IAS from our Service and serving at the same level of Joint Secretary, is bridged.
15.
  - (i) HRA @ 30% of basic pay, with no upper ceiling, for Officers posted in Kolkata Urban Agglomeration areas, New Delhi and in the three hill sub-divisions of the Darjeeling district.
  - (ii) HRA @ 20% of basic pay, with no upper ceiling, for Officers posted elsewhere in the State.
  - (iii) No restriction in admissibility of HRA to husband and wife working under the Government/Government aided Organization.
16. DA at par with that given by the GOI, and from the same date of effect given by the GOI.
17. Children Education Allowance, LTC, Transfer Grant - at par with those given by the GOI.

18. TA & DA — Existing system to continue, with proportionate quantum increase in rates after pay revision.
19. Hill Allowance & Winter Allowance— Quantum increase after pay revision (at existing rates).
20. Deputation Allowance — Recommendation of a specific guideline by the Hon'ble Commission.
21. Increase of Group Insurance cover to Rs. 7.2 lakhs (Premium– Rs. 720/- per month) for all Officers.

**C. Our Demands in respect of Retirement Benefits:**

1. Gratuity – Upper ceiling of Rs. 10 lakhs
2. Full pensionary benefits with 20 years of qualifying service.
3. Family Pension at GOI rates.
4. Increase of Pension/ Family Pension as implemented by GOI.

**D. Additional Ex-gratia compensation in cases of death occurring while performing official duty :**

- 1) Rs. 10 lakhs in case of accidents.
- 2) Rs. 15 lakh in cases of deaths because of terrorists/ antisocial activities or on account of natural disasters/ election related violence/ extreme weather condition.

**CONCLUSION**

We have attempted to cover all the aspects related to the Pay and Allowances of our Service in the above paragraphs for kind consideration of the Hon'ble Members of the Commission. However, we would like to have the scope of submission of a supplementary Memorandum before the Commission if required at all.